

CITY OF CUPERTINO
10300 Torre Avenue
Cupertino, California 95014

RESOLUTION NO. 6925

OF THE PLANNING COMMISSION OF THE CITY OF CUPERTINO DENYING
AN APPEAL AND UPHOLDING THE DIRECTOR OF COMMUNITY
DEVELOPMENT'S APPROVAL OF A TWO STORY PERMIT TO ALLOW A
NEW 2,992 SQUARE-FOOT TWO-STORY HOME WITH A 746 SQUARE-FOOT
ATTACHED ACCESSORY DWELLING UNIT LOCATED AT 1506 PRIMROSE
WAY

SECTION I: PROJECT DESCRIPTION

Application No.: R-2020-035
Applicant: Smart Lily, LLC (Khan and Hafiz residence)
Appellants: Jitesh Vadhia and Chih-Lung Lin
Location: 1506 Primrose Way (APN: 366-15-018)

SECTION II: FINDINGS FOR A USE PERMIT:

WHEREAS, the City of Cupertino received an application for a Two Story Permit to allow the construction of a new 2,992 square-foot two-story home with a 746 square-foot attached accessory dwelling unit; and

WHEREAS, the project is determined to be categorically exempt from the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) pursuant to Section 15303 of the CEQA Guidelines; and

WHEREAS, the necessary notices were given and the comment period for the application was provided as required by the Procedural Ordinance of the City of Cupertino; and

WHEREAS, the Director of Community Development made the findings required under Section 19.28.140(B) and approved the application with conditions on April 19, 2021; and

WHEREAS, the notice of decision was mailed to the appropriate parties, including the applicant and any person who contacted City staff with comments during the comment period, notifying them about the possibility of appealing a project; and

WHEREAS, the Planning Commission of the City of Cupertino received two appeals of the Community Development Director's approval of the Two Story Permit; and

WHEREAS, the necessary public notices have been given as required by the Procedural Ordinance of the City of Cupertino, and the Planning Commission has held at least one public hearing in regard to the appeal; and

WHEREAS, the appellants have not met the burden of proof required to support said appeal; and

WHEREAS, the Planning Commission finds as follows with regard to this application:

1. The project is consistent with the Cupertino General Plan, any applicable specific plans, zoning ordinance, and the purposes of the R-1 Ordinance; and

The proposed project is consistent with the General Plan as the project is within the Low Density land use area. There are no applicable specific plans that affect the project. The project has been found to be consistent with the requirements of Cupertino Municipal Code Chapter 19.28 Single Family (R-1) Residential.

2. The granting of the permit will not result in a condition that is detrimental or injurious to property or improvements in the vicinity, and will not be detrimental to the public health, safety, or welfare; and

The granting of the permit will not result in a condition that is detrimental or injurious to property improvements in the vicinity, and will not be detrimental to the public health, safety or welfare as the project is located within the R1-6 (Single Family Residential) zoning district, and will be compatible with the surrounding uses of the neighborhood. The project meets the building development regulations of the R-1 Ordinance and complies with the privacy protection measures to ensure that visual impacts to adjacent neighbors are mitigated.

3. The project is harmonious in scale and design with the general neighborhood; and

The proposed project is located in a residential area consisting of single-family homes. The subject neighborhood contains a mix of single-story and two-story homes, making the proposed project compatible with the neighborhood. The proposed 2,992 sq. ft. two-story residence is comparable in size to the existing residences in the surrounding area and complies with the R-1 Ordinance regulations for floor area ratio. Additionally, the project complies with all other development regulations for R1-6 zoned properties regarding mass and bulk, including, but not limited to, first floor building envelope, minimum setback regulations, and building height limitations. Furthermore, the applicant has worked with staff to make significant design changes to the front elevation to be more harmonious in scale

and design with the neighborhood. Design changes included decreasing the overall height of the project from 25'-8" to 23', simplifying the first and second-story rooflines to accommodate more gables, simplifying the two-story bay window feature to reduce the three-dimensional elements of the home, and making the windows more consistent and proportional throughout the project. Together, the reduced height and design changes provide better articulation of wall lines, reduce the visual mass of the exposed second story, and simplify the roofline. After all design changes listed above, staff is able to make the finding that the proposed project maintains the single-family home scale found compatible with the general neighborhood.

4. Adverse visual impacts on adjoining properties have been reasonably mitigated.

Any potential adverse visual impacts on adjoining properties have been reasonably mitigated through adherence to the setback requirements and privacy protection measures of the R-1 Ordinance. The proposal for 1506 Primrose Way meets, and in some cases exceeds, all setback requirements for the R1-6 zoning district. The project proposes a first-floor rear-yard setback of 28'-5" where only 20' is required; a second-story rear-yard setback of 34'-6" where 25' is required; and a rear-yard balcony setback of over 26'-6" where 20' is required.

The R-1 Ordinance allows property owners the ability to construct second-story windows and balconies as long as privacy protection trees and/or shrubs are planted as required by the ordinance. The project complies with the privacy screening requirements of the R-1 Ordinance by providing privacy screening plantings for the second-story balcony and second-story windows with a sill height below 5 feet along the rear (eastern) property line and signed privacy waivers for the right (southern) and left (northern) property lines. Per the R-1 Ordinance, the objective of privacy protection plantings is to provide substantial screening within three years of planting. Privacy protection plantings are considered Protected Trees under the City's Municipal Code (Chapter 14.18) and are recorded as such with a covenant against the property to inform current and future property owners about their protected status. Protected trees are not permitted to be removed without obtaining a tree removal permit and providing replacement plantings.

WHEREAS, the Planning Commission is the approval authority for this project and is granted the authority by the Municipal Code to exercise its independent judgment, based on the record before it, for purposes of the California Environmental Quality Act; and

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED that the Planning Commission takes the following actions:

1. Exercises its independent judgment and determines that the Project is exempt from CEQA pursuant to CEQA Guidelines section 15303. The Class 3 exemption applies to

new construction of small structures, including a single-family residence, or a second-dwelling unit in a residential zone.

2. Denies the appeal of an application for a Two Story Permit, Application no., R-2020-035, and upholds the Administrative approval of the Two Story Permit subject to the conditions which are enumerated in this Resolution beginning on PAGE 4 thereof. The conclusions and sub conclusions upon which the findings and conditions specified in this resolution are based, including those contained in the Public Hearing record concerning Application no. R-2020-035 as set forth in the Minutes of Planning Commission Meeting of June 22, 2021, are hereby incorporated by reference as though fully set forth herein.

SECTION III: CONDITIONS ADMINISTERED BY THE COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT DEPARTMENT

1. APPROVED EXHIBITS

The approval is based on a plan set entitled "Hafiz – New Residence, "consisting of fifteen (15) sheets labeled "A1, A2, A2.1(1), A2.1(2), A2.2, A3, A4, A5, A6, A7, A8, L1, L2, L3, and TP,"" except as may be amended by conditions in this resolution. In the event there are conflicts between the floor plan, cross sections and elevation drawings, the elevation drawings take precedence.

2. UNITS APPROVED

One 2,992 sq. ft. replacement single family home (44.5% FAR) and one 746 sq. ft. attached accessory dwelling unit has been approved. A covenant shall be recorded prior to final occupancy to ensure that there shall be no internal connection between the accessory dwelling unit and the principal dwelling unit throughout the lifetime of the home, nor shall the accessory dwelling unit ever be allowed to converted to be part of the principal dwelling unit.

3. ANNOTATION OF THE CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL

The conditions of approval set forth shall be incorporated into and annotated on the building plans.

4. ACCURACY OF PROJECT PLANS

The applicant/property owner is responsible to verify all pertinent property data including but not limited to property boundary locations, building setbacks, property size, building square footage, any relevant easements and/or construction records. Any misrepresentation of property data may invalidate this approval and may require additional review.

5. CONSULTATION WITH OTHER DEPARTMENTS

The applicant is responsible to consult with other departments and/or agencies with regard to the proposed project for additional conditions and requirements. Any misrepresentation of any submitted data may invalidate an approval by the Community Development Department.

6. CONCURRENT APPROVAL CONDITIONS

The conditions of approval contained in file no. RM-2020-023 shall be applicable to this approval.

7. PRIVACY PLANTING

The final privacy planting plan shall be reviewed and approved by the Planning Division prior to issuance of building permits. The variety, size, and planting distance shall be consistent with the City's requirements.

8. PRIVACY PROTECTION COVENANT

The property owner shall record a covenant on this property to inform future property owners of the privacy protection measures and tree protection requirements consistent with the R-1 Ordinance, for all windows with views into neighboring yards and a sill height that is 5 feet or less from the second story finished floor. The precise language will be subject to approval by the Director of Community Development. Proof of recordation must be submitted to the Community Development Department prior to final occupancy of the residence.

9. FRONT YARD TREE

The applicant shall indicate on site and landscape plans the location of a front yard tree to be located within the front yard setback area in order to screen the massing of the second story. The front yard tree shall be a minimum 24-inch box and 6 feet planted height and otherwise be consistent with the City's requirements.

10. FRONT YARD TREE COVENANT

The property owner shall record a covenant on this property with the Santa Clara County Recorder's Office that requires the retention and maintenance of the required front yard tree. The precise language will be subject to approval by the Director of Community Development. Proof of recordation must be submitted to the Community Development Department prior to final occupancy of the residence.

11. LANDSCAPE PROJECT SUBMITTAL

Prior to issuance of building permits, the applicant shall submit a full Landscape Documentation Package, per sections 14.15.050 A, B, C, and D of the Landscape Ordinance, for projects with landscape area 500 square feet or more or elect to submit a Prescriptive Compliance Application per sections 14.15.040 A, B, and C for projects

with landscape area between 500 square feet and 2,500 square feet. The Landscape Documentation Package or Prescriptive Compliance Application shall be reviewed and approved to the satisfaction of the Director of Community Development prior to issuance of building permits, and additional requirements per sections 14.15.040 D, E, F, and G or 14.15.050 E, F, G, H, and I will be required to be reviewed and approved prior to final inspections.

12. EXTERIOR BUILDING MATERIALS/TREATMENTS

The final building exterior plan shall closely resemble the details shown on the original approved plans. Final building exterior treatment plan (including but not limited to details on exterior color, materials, architectural treatments, doors, windows, lighting fixtures, and/or embellishments) shall be reviewed and approved by the Director of Community Development prior to issuance of building permits to ensure quality and consistency. Any exterior changes determined to be substantial by the Director of Community Development shall either require a modification to this permit or a new permit based on the extent of the change.

13. ACCESORY BUILDINGS/STRUCTURES

The location of all existing and proposed accessory buildings and/or structures shall be indicated on building permit plans and shall comply with Chapter 19.100, Accessory Buildings/Structures, of the Cupertino Municipal Code for review and approval prior to issuance of building permits.

14. DEMOLITION REQUIREMENTS

All demolished building and site materials shall be recycled to the maximum extent feasible subject to the Building Official. The applicant shall provide evidence that materials were recycled prior to issuance of final demolition permits.

15. DUST CONTROL

The following construction practices shall be implemented during all phases of construction for the proposed project to prevent visible dust emissions from leaving the site:

- a) Water all exposed surfaces areas (e.g., parking areas, staging areas, soil piles, graded areas, and unpaved access roads) at least twice daily and more often during windy periods to prevent visible dust from leaving the site; active areas adjacent to windy periods; active areas adjacent to existing land uses shall be kept damp at all times, or shall be treated with non-toxic stabilizers or dust palliatives.
- b) All haul trucks transporting soil, sand, or other loose material off-site shall be covered.

- c) All visible mud or dirt track-out onto adjacent public roads shall be removed using wet power vacuum street sweepers at least once per day. The use of dry power sweeping is prohibited.
- d) All vehicle speeds on unpaved roads shall be limited to 15 mph.
- e) All roadways, driveways, and sidewalks to be paved shall be completed as soon as possible. Building pads shall be laid as soon as possible after grading unless seeding or soil binders are used.
- f) Idling times shall be minimized either by shutting equipment off when not in use or reducing the maximum idling time to 5 minutes (as required by the California airborne toxics control measure Title 13, Section 2485 of California Code of Regulations [CCR]). Clear signage shall be provided for construction workers at all access points.
- g) All construction equipment shall be maintained and properly tuned in accordance with manufacturer's specifications. All equipment shall be checked by a certified mechanic and determined to be running in proper condition prior to operation.
- h) Post a publicly visible sign with the telephone number and person to contact at the Lead Agency regarding dust complaints. This person shall respond and take corrective action within 48 hours. The Air District's phone number shall also be visible to ensure compliance with applicable regulations.

The applicant shall incorporate the City's construction best management practices into the building permit plan set prior to any grading, excavation, foundation or building permit issuance.

16. COMPLIANCE WITH PUBLIC WORKS CONFIRMATION FORM

The project shall comply with the requirements indicated on the Public Works Confirmation form dated 11/05/2020, including, but not limited to, dedications, easements, off-site improvements, undergrounding of utilities, all necessary agreements, and utility installations/relocations as deemed necessary by the Director of Public Works and required for public health and safety. The Public Works Confirmation is a preliminary review, and is not an exhaustive review of the subject development. Additional requirements may be established and implemented during the construction permitting process. The project construction plans shall address these requirements with the construction permit submittal, and all required improvements shall be completed to the satisfaction of the Director of Public Works prior to final occupancy.

17. GRADING AND CONSTRUCTION HOURS AND NOISE LIMITS

- a) All grading activities shall be limited to the dry season (April 15 to October 1), unless permitted otherwise by the Director of Public works.

- b) Construction hours and noise limits shall be compliant with all requirements of Chapter 10.48 of the Cupertino Municipal Code.
- c) Grading, street construction, underground utility and demolition hours for work done more than 750 feet away from residential areas shall be limited to Monday through Friday, 7 a.m. to 8 p.m. and Saturday and Sunday, 9 a.m. to 6 p.m. Grading, street construction, demolition or underground utility work within 750 feet of residential areas shall not occur on Saturdays, Sundays, holidays, and during the nighttime period as defined in Section 10.48.053(b) of the Municipal Code.
- d) Construction activities shall be limited to Monday through Friday, 7 a.m. to 8 p.m. and Saturday and Sunday, 9 a.m. to 6 p.m. Construction activities are not allowed on holidays as defined in Chapter 10.48 of the Municipal Code. Night time construction is allowed if compliant with nighttime standards of Section 10.48 of the Cupertino Municipal Code.
- e) Rules and regulations pertaining to all construction activities and limitations identified in this permit, along with the name and telephone number of an applicant appointed disturbance coordinator, shall be posted in a prominent location at the entrance to the job site.
- f) The applicant shall be responsible for educating all contractors and subcontractors of said construction restrictions.

The applicant shall comply with the above grading and construction hours and noise limit requirements unless otherwise indicated.

18. DARK SKY ORDINANCE COMPLIANCE

The applicant shall comply with Dark Sky Ordinance regulations, as applicable, prior to issuance of the building permit.

19. BIRD SAFE ORDINANCE COMPLIANCE

The applicant shall comply with the Bird Safe Ordinance regulations, as applicable, prior to issuance of the building permit.

20. ATTIC SPACE

All proposed attic space shall be non-habitable space. The applicant shall provide drawings prior to building permit issuance demonstrating all proposed attic spaces meet this requirement.

21. NESTING BIRDS

Nests of raptors and other birds shall be protected when in active use, as required by the federal Migratory Bird Treaty Act and the California Department of Fish and Game Code.

-
- a) Construction and tree removal/pruning activities shall be scheduled to avoid the nesting season to the extent feasible. If feasible, tree removal and/or pruning shall be completed before the start of the nesting season to help preclude nesting. The nesting season for most birds and raptors in the San Francisco Bay area extends from February 1 through August 31. Preconstruction surveys (described below) are not required for tree removal or construction activities outside the nesting period. If construction activities and any required tree removal occur during the nesting season (February 1 and August 31), a qualified ornithologist shall be required to conduct surveys prior to tree removal or construction activities. Preconstruction surveys shall be conducted no more than 14 days prior to the start of tree removal, pruning or construction. Preconstruction surveys shall be repeated at 14-day intervals until construction has been initiated in the area after which surveys can be stopped. During this survey, the ornithologist shall inspect all trees and other possible nesting habitats in and immediately adjacent to the construction areas for nests.
 - b) If the survey does not identify any nesting birds that would be affected by construction activities, no further mitigation is required. If an active nest containing viable eggs or young birds is found sufficiently close to work areas to be disturbed by these activities, their locations shall be documented and protective measures implemented under the direction of the qualified ornithologist until the nests no longer contain eggs or young birds.
 - c) Protective measures shall include establishment of clearly delineated exclusion zones (i.e. demarcated by identifiable fencing, such as orange construction fencing or equivalent) around each nest location as determined by the qualified ornithologist, taking into account the species of birds nesting, their tolerance for disturbance and proximity to existing development. In general, exclusion zones shall be a minimum of 300 feet for raptors and 75 feet for passerines and other birds. The active nest within an exclusion zone shall be monitored on a weekly basis throughout the nesting season to identify signs of disturbance and confirm nesting status. The radius of an exclusion zone may be increased by the qualified biologist, if project activities are determined to be adversely affecting the nesting birds. Exclusion zones may be reduced by the qualified biologist only in consultation with California Department of Fish and Wildlife. The protection measures and buffers shall remain in effect until the young have left the nest and are foraging independently or the nest is no longer active.
 - d) A final report on nesting birds and raptors, including survey methodology, survey date(s), map of identified active nests (if any), and protection measures (if required), shall be submitted to the Planning Manager, through the building

permit review process, and be completed to the satisfaction of the Community Development Director prior to the start of grading.

22. INDEMNIFICATION AND LIMITATION OF LIABILITY

As part of the application, to the fullest extent permitted by law, the applicant shall agree to indemnify, defend with the attorneys of the City's choice, and hold harmless the City, its City Council, and its officers, employees, and agents (collectively, the "indemnified parties") from and against any liability, claim, action, cause of action, suit, damages, judgment, lien, levy, or proceeding (collectively referred to as "proceeding") brought by a third party against one or more of the indemnified parties or one or more of the indemnified parties and the applicant related to any Ordinance, Resolution, or action approving the project, the related entitlements, environmental review documents, finding or determinations, or any other permit or approval authorized for the project. The indemnification shall include but not be limited to damages, fees, and costs awarded against the City, if any, and cost of suit, attorneys' fees, and other costs, liabilities, and expenses incurred in connection with such proceeding whether incurred by the Applicant, the City, or the parties initiating or bringing such proceeding.

The applicant shall agree to (without limitation) reimburse the City its actual attorneys' fees and costs incurred in defense of the litigation. Such attorneys' fees and costs shall include amounts paid to the City's outside counsel and shall include City Attorney time and overhead costs and other City staff overhead costs and any costs directly related to the litigation reasonably incurred by City. The applicant shall likewise agree to indemnify, defend, and hold harmless the indemnified parties from and against any damages, attorneys' fees, or costs awards, including attorneys' fees awarded under Code of Civil Procedure section 1021.5, assessed or awarded against the indemnified parties. The Applicant shall cooperate with the City to enter a Reimbursement Agreement to govern any such reimbursement.

The Applicant shall agree to (without limitation) reimburse the City for all costs incurred in additional investigation or study of, or for supplementing, redrafting, revising, or amending, any document (such as an Environmental Impact Report, negative declaration, specific plan, or general plan amendment) if made necessary by proceedings challenging the project approvals and related environmental review, if the applicant desires to continue to pursue the project.

The Applicant shall agree that the City shall have no liability to the Applicant for business interruption, punitive, speculative, or consequential damages.

23. NOTICE OF FEES, DEDICATIONS, RESERVATIONS OR OTHER EXACTIONS

The Conditions of Project Approval set forth herein may include certain fees, dedication requirements, reservation requirements, and other exactions.

PASSED AND ADOPTED this 22nd day of June, 2021 at a noticed Public Hearing of the Planning Commission of the City of Cupertino, State of California, held by the Director of Community Development, or his or her designee, pursuant to Cupertino Municipal Code Section 19.12.120.

AYES: COMMISSIONERS: Chair Wang, Vice Chair Scharf

NOES: COMMISSIONERS: None

ABSTAIN: COMMISSIONERS: Kapil

ABSENT: COMMISSIONERS: Madhhipatla, Saxena

ATTEST:

APPROVED:

/s/ Piu Ghosh

Piu Ghosh
Planning Manager

/s/ R "Ray" Wang

R "Ray" Wang
Chair, Planning Commission